The Story of "3N Points in a Plane" Günter M. Ziegler



- 0. Why do you care?
- 1. A short history
- 2. A short history, with colors
- 3. A tight colored Tverberg theorem
- 4. Tverberg strikes back

Looks harmlessFind the right theorem!

- Find the right theorem!
- Interesting machinery test the machinery!

- Find the right theorem!
- Interesting machinery test the machinery!
- Leaves mystery.

- Find the right theorem!
- Interesting machinery test the machinery!
- Leaves mystery. Things to to (for you).

Plan

- 0. Why do you care?
- 1. A short history
- 2. A short history, with colors
- 3. A tight colored Tverberg theorem
- 4. Tverberg strikes back

Birch's Theorem 1.

Any 3N points in a plane can be partitioned into N triangles that intersect.



Birch's Theorem 1

Any 3N points in a plane can be partitioned into N triangles that intersect.



Birch's Theorem 1

Any 3N points in a plane can be partitioned into N triangles that intersect.





Birch's Theorem 1*.



Birch's Theorem 1*.



Birch's Theorem 1*.



Birch's Theorem 1*.





Bryan John Birch (*1931)

- 1954 Eggleston course at Cambridge 1956 thesis
- 1958 Eggleston's book "Convexity"
- 1959 "On 3N points in a plane" Math. Proc. Cambridge Phil. Soc.



Bryan John Birch (*1931)

- 1954 Eggleston course at Cambridge 1956 thesis
- 1958 Eggleston's book "Convexity"
- 1959 "On 3N points in a plane" Math. Proc. Cambridge Phil. Soc.



"very probably 1959 was when I gave up trying to prove higher dimensional cases of Tverberg's theorem \dots "

Bryan John Birch (*1931)

- 1954 Eggleston course at Cambridge
- 1956 thesis
- 1958 Eggleston's book "Convexity"
- 1959 "On 3N points in a plane" Math. Proc. Cambridge Phil. Soc.
- 1965 "Notes on elliptic curves, II" (with Peter Swinnerton-Dyer)



"very probably 1959 was when I gave up trying to prove higher dimensional cases of Tverberg's theorem \dots "

Birch's Conjecture

(n+1)N - n points in \mathbb{R}^n can be partitioned into N subsets whose convex hulls intersect.



- Helge Tverberg (*1935)
- 1961 UCL London
- 1962 ICM Stockholm
- 1963 3D case
- 1964 Manchester
- 1966 "A generalization of Radon's theorem"



- Helge Tverberg (*1935)
- 1961 UCL London
- 1962 ICM Stockholm
- 1963 3D case
- 1964 Manchester
- 1966 "A generalization of Radon's theorem"



"... I recall that the weather was bitterly cold in Manchester. I awoke very early one morning shivering ..."

- Helge Tverberg (*1935)
- 1961 UCL London
- 1962 ICM Stockholm
- 1963 3D case
- 1964 Manchester
- 1966 "A generalization of Radon's theorem"
- 1981 "A generalization of Radon's theorem, II



"... I recall that the weather was bitterly cold in Manchester. I awoke very early one morning shivering ..."

- Helge Tverberg (*1935)
- 1961 UCL London
- 1962 ICM Stockholm
- 1963 3D case
- 1964 Manchester
- 1966 "A generalization of Radon's theorem"
- 1981 "A generalization of Radon's theorem, II
- 1993 "On generalizations of Radon's theorem and"



"... I recall that the weather was bitterly cold in Manchester. I awoke very early one morning shivering ..."

Change in notation:

 $egin{array}{ccccc} n & \longrightarrow & d \ N & \longrightarrow & r \ (n+1)N-n & \longrightarrow & (d+1)r-d \end{array}$

Change in notation:

$$egin{array}{cccccc} n & \longrightarrow & d \ N & \longrightarrow & r \ (n+1)N-n & \longrightarrow & (d+1)r-d \ & = & (d+1)(r-1)+1 \end{array}$$

Change in notation:

$$n \longrightarrow d$$

$$N \longrightarrow r$$

$$(n+1)N-n \longrightarrow (d+1)r-d$$

$$= (d+1)(r-1)+1$$

$$= N+1$$

Birch's Conjecture = Tverberg's Theorem. [Tverberg 1966]

Let $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$, N := (d + 1)(r - 1). For every affine map

$$f:\Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$$

there are r disjoint faces of Δ_N whose f-images intersect.



Birch's Conjecture = Tverberg's Theorem. [Tverberg 1966]

Let $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$, N := (d + 1)(r - 1). For every affine map

$$f:\Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$$

there are r disjoint faces of Δ_N whose f-images intersect.





"Topological Tverberg Theorem". [Bárány, Shlosman & Szücz 1981]; [Özaydin 1987]; ...) Let $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$, N := (d + 1)(r - 1). For every continuous map

$$f: \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$$

there are r disjoint faces of Δ_N whose f-images intersect.





"<mark>Topological Tverberg Theorem</mark>". [Bárány, Shlosman & Szücz 1981]; [Özaydin 1987]; ...**)**

Proof.

"<mark>Topological Tverberg Theorem</mark>". [Bárány, Shlosman & Szücz 1981]; [Özaydin 1987]; ...**)**

Proof. For linear maps: Linear Algebra [Sarkaria & Onn].

"<mark>Topological Tverberg Theorem</mark>". [Bárány, Shlosman & Szücz 1981]; [Özaydin 1987]; ...**)**

Proof.

For linear maps: Linear Algebra [Sarkaria & Onn].

For continuous maps, r a prime: Use the Borsuk–Ulam theorem, see [Matoušek 2003].

"<mark>Topological Tverberg Theorem</mark>". [Bárány, Shlosman & Szücz 1981]; [Özaydin 1987];)

Proof.

For linear maps: Linear Algebra [Sarkaria & Onn].

For continuous maps, r a prime: Use the Borsuk–Ulam theorem, see [Matoušek 2003].

For continuous maps, $r = p^k$: Equivariant cohomology, spectral sequences.

"<mark>Topological Tverberg Theorem</mark>". [Bárány, Shlosman & Szücz 1981]; [Özaydin 1987];)

Proof.

For linear maps: Linear Algebra [Sarkaria & Onn].

For continuous maps, r a prime: Use the Borsuk–Ulam theorem, see [Matoušek 2003].

For continuous maps, $r = p^k$: Equivariant cohomology, spectral sequences.

For other r: open problem.



Plan

- 0. Why do you care?
- 1. A short history
- 2. A short history, with colors
- 3. A tight colored Tverberg theorem
- 4. Tverberg strikes back
[Bárány, Füredi & Lovász 1988/1990]: On the number of halving planes

"For this we need a colored version of Tverberg's theorem:

[Bárány, Füredi & Lovász 1988/1990]: On the number of halving planes

"For this we need a colored version of Tverberg's theorem:

Lemma 3. There is a positive integer t such that the following holds. Assume that $A, B, C \subset \mathbb{R}^2$ are disjoint sets with at least t elements each, such that their union is in general position. Then there exist three disjoint triples $a_i b_i c_i$, $a_i \in A$, $b_i \in B$, $c_i \in C$ $(1 \le i \le 3)$ such that $\bigcap_i \operatorname{conv}(a_i b_i c_i) \neq 0$.

[Bárány, Füredi & Lovász 1988/1990]: On the number of halving planes

"For this we need a colored version of Tverberg's theorem:

Lemma 3. There is a positive integer t such that the following holds. Assume that $A, B, C \subset \mathbb{R}^2$ are disjoint sets with at least t elements each, such that their union is in general position. Then there exist three disjoint triples $a_i b_i c_i$, $a_i \in A$, $b_i \in B$, $c_i \in C$ $(1 \le i \le 3)$ such that $\bigcap_i \operatorname{conv}(a_i b_i c_i) \neq 0$.

The smallest value of t for which we managed to prove this lemma is 4, and we do not have a counterexample even for t = 3. For brevity's sake we give the proof for t = 7."

2. A short history, with colors [Bárány & Larman 1991]:

"A colored version of Tverberg's theorem"

2. A short history, with colors [Bárány & Larman 1991]:

"A colored version of Tverberg's theorem"



[Bárány & Larman 1991]:

"A colored version of Tverberg's theorem"



[Bárány & Larman 1991]:

"A colored version of Tverberg's theorem"



[Bárány & Larman 1991]:

"A colored version of Tverberg's theorem"

Theorem. Given r red, r white, r green points in the plane, it is possible to form r vertex-disjoint triangles $\Delta_1, \ldots, \Delta_r$ in such a way that Δ_i has one red, one white, and one green vertex for every $i = 1, \ldots, r$ and the intersection of these triangles is non-empty.

not tight!



The Colored Tverberg Problem. [Bárány & Larman 1991] For $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$, determine the smallest N(r, d) such that if $N \ge N(r, d)$ the following holds:

If $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have d + 1 colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \ge r$, then Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.



The Colored Tverberg Problem. [Bárány & Larman 1991] For $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$, determine the smallest N(r, d) such that if $N \ge N(r, d)$ the following holds:

If $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have d + 1 colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \ge r$, then Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

not tight!



"Colored Tverberg Theorem".

For $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$ suitable, $N \ge t(d + 1) - 1$, the following holds:

If $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have d + 1 colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \ge t$, then Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.



"Colored Tverberg Theorem".

For $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$ suitable, $N \ge t(d + 1) - 1$, the following holds:

If $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have d + 1 colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \ge t$, then Δ_N has r disjoint rambow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

[Živaljević & Vrećica 1992]: t = 2r - 1 suffices for *r* prime t = 4r - 3 suffices

"Colored Tverberg Theorem".

For $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$ suitable, $N \ge t(d + 1) - 1$, the following holds:

If $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have d + 1 colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \ge t$, then Δ_N has r disjoint rambow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

[Živaljević & Vrećica 1992]: t = 2r - 1 suffices for *r* prime t = 4r - 3 suffices

[Blagojević, Matschke & Z. 2009]: t = r suffices for r + 1 prime t = r + o(r) suffices

"Colored Tverberg Theorem".

For $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$ suitable, $N \ge t(d + 1) - 1$, the following holds:

If $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have d + 1 colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \ge t$, then Δ_N has r disjoint rambow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

[Živaljević & Vrećica 1992]: t = 2r - 1 suffices for r prime t = 4r - 3 suffices

[Blagojević, Matschke & Z. 2009]: t = r suffices for r + 1 prime t = r + o(r) suffices



Plan

- 0. Why do you care?
- 1. A short history
- 2. A short history, with colors
- 3. A tight colored Tverberg theorem
- 4. Tverberg strikes back

2. A tight colored Tverberg theorem "Tight Colored Tverberg Theorem" [Blagojević, Matschke & Z. 2009] Let $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$ prime, N := (d + 1)(r - 1), $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$ continuous, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have $m \ge d + 2$ colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \le r - 1$. Then Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow faces whose f-images intersect.



2. A tight colored Tverberg theorem "Tight Colored Tverberg Theorem" [Blagojević, Matschke & Z. 2009] Let $d \ge 1$, $r \ge 2$ prime, N := (d + 1)(r - 1), $f : \Delta_N \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$ continuous, where the N + 1 vertices of Δ_N have $m \ge d + 2$ colors, each color class of size $|C_i| \le r - 1$. Then Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow faces whose f-images intersect.





Reduction Lemma

([Sarkaria 2000]) It suffices to prove the Theorem for the special case $|C_0| = |C_1| = \cdots = |C_d| = r - 1, |C_{d+1}| = 1$

Reduction Lemma

([Sarkaria 2000]) It suffices to prove the Theorem for the special case $|C_0| = |C_1| = \cdots = |C_d| = r - 1$, $|C_{d+1}| = 1$

... see [de Longueville 2003]

Reduction Lemma ([Sarkaria 2000]) It suffices to prove the Theorem for the special case $|C_0| = |C_1| = \cdots = |C_d| = r - 1, |C_{d+1}| = 1$

... see [de Longueville 2003]

Configuration Space/Test Map (CS/TM) Scheme ([Van Kampen 1932], [Sarkaria 1991], [Živaljević 1997+])

combinatorial configuration space

deleted joins

Reduction Lemma ([Sarkaria 2000]) It suffices to prove the Theorem for the special case $|C_0| = |C_1| = \cdots = |C_d| = r - 1, |C_{d+1}| = 1$

... see [de Longueville 2003]

Configuration Space/Test Map (CS/TM) Scheme ([Van Kampen 1932], [Sarkaria 1991], [Živaljević 1997+])

- combinatorial configuration space
- deleted joins

... see [Matoušek 2003]!



Proof 1 . . . using Degree:

$$F: (\Delta_{r-1,r})^{*(d+1)} \longrightarrow_{\mathbb{Z}_r} S^{N-1}$$

map of orientable pseudomanifolds

deg(F) mod r the same for all Z_r-equivariant F
deg(F) = 0 if F extends to (Δ_{r-1,r})*(d+1) * [r]
deg(F₀) = (r - 1)!^d for special configuration:



Proof 2 . . . using Obstruction Theory:

[tom Dieck 1987, Sect. II.3] (apply with care, as \mathfrak{S}_r -action not free!)



-1

Proof works, i.e.

$$(\Delta_{r-1,r})^{*(d+1)} * [r] \longrightarrow_{\mathfrak{S}_r} S^N$$

f and only if
 $r \nmid (r-1)!^{d+1}$
.e. if

r is prime.

Proof 3 . . . using Equivariant Index:

[Fadell-Husseini 1988]



still more complicated

(... equivariant cohomology, index, spectral sequences)

avoids reduction to the special case $|C_0| = |C_1| = \cdots = |C_d| = r - 1, \ |C_{d+1}| = 1$

 thus allows for generalizations: Tight cases of the Tverberg–Vrećica Conjecture [Blagojevic, Matschke & Z. 2011]

Plan

- 0. Why do you care?
- 1. A short history
- 2. A short history, with colors
- 3. A tight colored Tverberg theorem
- 4. Tverberg strikes back

Lemma ("Tverberg unavoidable color class") [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge (r - 1)(d + 1)$, let C be a set of $|C| \le 2r - 1$ vertices of Δ_N , and $f : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^d$ continuous.

Then every Tverberg r-partition has a block with at most 1 vertex in C.

Lemma ("Tverberg unavoidable color class") [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge (r - 1)(d + 1)$, let C be a set of $|C| \le 2r - 1$ vertices of Δ_N , and $f : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^d$ continuous.

Then every Tverberg r-partition has a block with at most 1 vertex in C.

Proof.

Lemma ("Tverberg unavoidable color class") [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge (r-1)(d+1)$, let C be a set of $|C| \le 2r - 1$ vertices of Δ_N , and $f : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^d$ continuous.

Then every Tverberg r-partition has a block with at most 1 vertex in C.

Proof. $f : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^d$ has a Tverberg *r*-partition, by TTT.

Lemma ("Tverberg unavoidable color class") [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge (r - 1)(d + 1)$, let C be a set of $|C| \le 2r - 1$ vertices of Δ_N , and $f : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^d$ continuous.

Then every Tverberg r-partition has a block with at most 1 vertex in C.

Proof. $f : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^d$ has a Tverberg *r*-partition, by TTT. Pigeonhole Principle.

"Weak colored Tverberg Theorem". [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge 2(r-1)(d+1)$, and let the vertices of Δ_N be in d+1 color classes C_0, \ldots, C_d of size $|C_i| \le 2r-1$.

Then for every continuous $f : \Delta_r \to \mathbb{R}^d$, Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect. **verberg strikes back Weak colored Tverberg Theorem**. [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge 2(r-1)(d+1)$, and let the vertices of Δ_N be in d+1 color classes C_0, \ldots, C_d of size $|C_i| \le 2r - 1$. Then for every continuous $f : \Delta_r \to \mathbb{R}^d$, Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

Proof. Let $g_i : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}$ measure the distance from the subcomplex of Δ_N of all faces with at most 1 vertex in C_i .

Verberg strikes back "Weak colored Tverberg Theorem". [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge 2(r-1)(d+1)$, and let the vertices of Δ_N be in d+1 color classes C_0, \ldots, C_d of size $|C_i| \le 2r - 1$. Then for every continuous $f : \Delta_r \to \mathbb{R}^d$, Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

Proof. Let $g_i : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}$ measure the distance from the subcomplex of Δ_N of all faces with at most 1 vertex in C_i . $(f, g_0, \ldots, g_d) : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^{2d+1}$ has a Tverberg *r*-partition, by TTT. **Verberg strikes back** "Weak colored Tverberg Theorem". [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge 2(r-1)(d+1)$, and let the vertices of Δ_N be in d+1 color classes C_0, \ldots, C_d of size $|C_i| \le 2r - 1$. Then for every continuous $f : \Delta_r \to \mathbb{R}^d$, Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

Proof. Let $g_i : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}$ measure the distance from the subcomplex of Δ_N of all faces with at most 1 vertex in C_i . $(f, g_0, \ldots, g_d) : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^{2d+1}$ has a Tverberg *r*-partition, by TTT. Thus there are $x_1, \ldots, x_r \in \Delta_N$ in disjoint faces with $f(x_1) = \cdots = f(x_r)$. **Everberg strikes back** "Weak colored Tverberg Theorem". [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge 2(r-1)(d+1)$, and let the vertices of Δ_N be in d + 1 color classes C_0, \ldots, C_d of size $|C_i| \le 2r - 1$. Then for every continuous $f : \Delta_r \to \mathbb{R}^d$, Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

Proof. Let $g_i : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}$ measure the distance from the subcomplex of Δ_N of all faces with at most 1 vertex in C_i . $(f, g_0, \ldots, g_d) : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^{2d+1}$ has a Tverberg *r*-partition, by TTT. Thus there are $x_1, \ldots, x_r \in \Delta_N$ in disjoint faces with $f(x_1) = \cdots = f(x_r)$.

For each *i*, there is a block F_j with at most 1 vertex in C_i , so $g_i(x_j) = 0$, while also $g_i(x_1) = \cdots = g_i(x_r)$.

Everberg strikes back "Weak colored Tverberg Theorem". [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge 2(r-1)(d+1)$, and let the vertices of Δ_N be in d+1 color classes C_0, \ldots, C_d of size $|C_i| \le 2r - 1$. Then for every continuous $f : \Delta_r \to \mathbb{R}^d$, Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

Proof. Let $g_i : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}$ measure the distance from the subcomplex of Δ_N of all faces with at most 1 vertex in C_i . $(f, g_0, \ldots, g_d) : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^{2d+1}$ has a Tverberg *r*-partition, by TTT. Thus there are $x_1, \ldots, x_r \in \Delta_N$ in disjoint faces with $f(x_1) = \cdots = f(x_r)$.

For each *i*, there is a block F_j with at most 1 vertex in C_i , so $g_i(x_j) = 0$, while also $g_i(x_1) = \cdots = g_i(x_r)$.

Thus each block has at most 1 vertex in C_i .
Everberg strikes back "Weak colored Tverberg Theorem". [Blagojević, Frick & Z. 2014] Let $d \ge 1$, $r = p^k$, $N \ge 2(r-1)(d+1)$, and let the vertices of Δ_N be in d+1 color classes C_0, \ldots, C_d of size $|C_i| \le 2r - 1$. Then for every continuous $f : \Delta_r \to \mathbb{R}^d$, Δ_N has r disjoint rainbow d-faces whose f-images intersect.

Proof. Let $g_i : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}$ measure the distance from the subcomplex of Δ_N of all faces with at most 1 vertex in C_i . $(f, g_0, \ldots, g_d) : \Delta_N \to \mathbb{R}^{2d+1}$ has a Tverberg *r*-partition, by TTT. Thus there are $x_1, \ldots, x_r \in \Delta_N$ in disjoint faces with $f(x_1) = \cdots = f(x_r)$.

For each *i*, there is a block F_j with at most 1 vertex in C_i , so $g_i(x_j) = 0$, while also $g_i(x_1) = \cdots = g_i(x_r)$.

Thus each block has at most 1 vertex in C_i .

Plan

- 0. Why do you care?
- 1. A short history
- 2. A short history, with colors
- 3. A tight colored Tverberg theorem
- 4. Tverberg strikes back
- 5. More





Proof for *r* not prime powers?



Proof for *r* not prime powers?

How to *find* a solution?



Proof for *r* not prime powers?

How to *find* a solution?

Many solutions?



Proof for *r* not prime powers?

How to *find* a solution?

Many solutions?





